

## Evaluation of Research and Scholarship (Draft #4)

Scholarship is a central component to the work of tenure-eligible and tenured faculty members of the School of Education at Iowa State University. As a member of the Association of American Universities (AAU), Iowa State University has high standards for the scholarship of its faculty members and characterizes scholarship as follows:

Scholarship is creative, systematic, rational inquiry into a topic and the honest, forthright application or exposition of conclusions drawn from that inquiry. It builds on existing knowledge and employs critical analysis and judgment to enhance understanding. Scholarship is the umbrella under which research falls, but research is just one form of scholarship. Scholarship also encompasses creative activities, teaching, and extension/professional practice. (ISU *Faculty Handbook*, <http://www.provost.iastate.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/fh/2013a-faculty-handbook.pdf>, downloaded December 5, 2013).

As the Iowa State University *Faculty Handbook* points out, scholarship can take many forms. Among these are books, journal articles, critical reviews, bibliographies, lectures, technology-based products, patents, art exhibits by teacher-artists; musical concerts with original scores, novels, essays, short stories, poems; and scholarly articles published in non-research based periodicals, newspapers, and other publications. The Handbook goes on to define scholarship as materials that generally are called “intellectual property” (ISU *Faculty Handbook*, <http://www.provost.iastate.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/fh/2013a-faculty-handbook.pdf>, downloaded December 5, 2013).

Faculty members are expected to maintain consistent productivity in both the quality and quantity of their scholarly works over the course of their careers. These expectations are influenced by a faculty member’s rank, time in rank, and allocation of time dedicated to scholarly activities as defined by the Professional Responsibility Statement (PRS). Additionally, because education is an interdisciplinary field of study with many subfields, a guiding principle regarding faculty productivity is that the number or nature of these scholarly works will be influenced by the standards in the faculty member’s subfield and/or discipline. In general, the expectation for faculty productivity is that at the pre-tenure stage faculty members are expected to lay a foundation of scholarly works in their subfield and/or discipline, while at the associate stage faculty members are expected to be an immersed scholar in their subfield or discipline and at the full stage faculty members are expected to be provide scholarly leadership in their subfield and/or discipline.

Table 1, taken from the Faculty Handbook, provides a depiction of the nature of scholarship. The table is based on the work of Conrad J. Weisser and Ernest L. Boyer (ISU *Faculty Handbook*, <http://www.provost.iastate.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/fh/2013a-faculty-handbook.pdf>, downloaded December 5, 2013).

Table 1. The Nature of Scholarship

| Character of scholarship   | Audiences for scholarship  | Means of communicating scholarship  | Criteria for validating scholarship   | Means of documenting scholarship   |
|--|--|---|---|--|
| Develops and communicates new understanding and insight. Generates, synthesizes, interprets, critically analyzes, and communicates new knowledge, methods, understandings, technologies, materials, uses, insights, beauty and so forth. | Peers, undergraduates students, graduate students, post-doctoral associates, users, patrons, publics, etc. | Teaching materials and methods, classes, curricula; publications, presentations, exhibits, performances, patents, copyrights, distribution of materials or programs, etc. | Originality, significance, accuracy, replicability, scope, applicability, breadth, depth and duration of influence, persistence of influence or use, adoption by peers, impact or public benefits, etc. | Present evidence that creative intellectual work was validated by peers; communicated to peers and broader audiences; recognized, accepted, cited, adopted, or used by others. In other words, the scholarship made a difference |

The School of Education is committed to excellence in the many forms of scholarship produced by our faculty members. In determining the influence of a faculty member's scholarship, we rely, to a great extent, on the norms of faculty member subfields and/or disciplines. We thus ask members of various subfields and disciplines to help us understand the values and scholarly outlets that are held in high esteem by their subfields and disciplines. We believe this exchange of ideas about scholarship is vital to supporting an intellectually vibrant community of scholars.

### Scholarly Products

The following is not an exhaustive list of scholarly products. Rather, this is a sample of scholarly products that are generated by faculty members in the School of Education. The scholarly works are not listed in a particular order; that is, one should not infer from the list a tacit ranking of these examples of scholarly works.

#### Presentations

Scholarly presentations at academic conferences are used to introduce preliminary research, innovative practices, new ideas, or other forms of scholarship. Those who present seek comment and criticism with the goal being to strengthen their scholarly work. Faculty members in a specific area of study should agree upon the most valued professional conferences. The importance of presenting at a professional conference will be influenced by such factors as the selectivity of the conference and the scope of the

meeting. Delivering an invited presentation or keynote address will add luster to a conference presentation for a faculty member.

### Journal Articles

Presentations at professional conferences often evolve into articles that are published in a journal. Journals that publish articles through a blind review or “masked” process typically are regarded more highly than those that publish manuscripts that are reviewed through a less rigorous process. Within their subfields and/or disciplines faculty will be asked to identify publication outlets held in high regard.

Certain subfields and/ or disciplines may have outlets for article publication other than journals, such as scholarly magazines, where the acceptance rate is comparable to the most rigorous journals. Publications in scholarly magazines will be evaluated by criteria such as acceptance rate, distribution characteristics of the publication, and the publication’s influence on the scholarly subfield and/or discipline it represents.

### Grant Proposals and Funded Projects

As appropriate, SOE faculty members are encouraged to prepare and submit proposals for funding designed to support their scholarship. Some academic subfields and disciplines have greater potential for success in securing external funding than others, but we believe external funding can be an important element in completing scholarly projects successfully.

SOE faculty members are encouraged to seek funding made available through various offices at Iowa State University. Often such funding is a first step in building a portfolio of funded projects. Depending on the criteria for the project, faculty members are urged to participate in submitting for funding from the university.

Faculty members also are encouraged to seek funding to support their scholarly projects from governmental agencies, foundations, not for profit organizations and other funding sources. Securing external funding can be central in developing a flow of resources necessary to complete scholarly projects. Developing complex proposals for funding can be time intensive, and faculty at a pre-tenure level need to be careful in the apportionment of their time devoted to seeking external funding to support their research.

### Book Chapters

Book chapters typically result from an invitation from an editor to submit a manuscript that is designed to be published with a collection of other chapters in book form. The submission rarely goes through a blind or masked review but that is balanced by the judgment of the book’s editor about the chapter author’s stature in the academic subfield or discipline and ability to deliver a scholarly product on a timely basis. Among the factors that contribute to the stature of book chapter are the publisher of the book,

reviews of the volume that may include commentary about the specific chapter, volumes sold and citations of the chapter in other scholarly works.

### Books

Books can take the form of edited volumes, or publications that are written by one or more authors. Edited books often are regarded differently than authored volumes. Typically, books take several years from the development of a proposal to the actual publication of the volume. Several factors contribute to the stature of a book including the publisher, reviews of the book, and the number of volumes sold. The audience for the book also will contribute to how it is regarded. That is, textbooks typically are regarded differently than those written for an audience of peers in one's subfield or discipline. Citations from the book also can contribute to the prestige of the volume.

### Other Forms of Scholarship

Other ~~publications~~ products also can contribute to a faculty member's portfolio of scholarship. These can include but are not limited to monographs, computer software and other technology-based intellectual products, curriculum development, technical reports, occasional papers, policy briefings, conference proceedings, patents, copyrighted materials such as measurement instruments, **professional applications of research/knowledge** or commissioned works by professional organizations. There is no uniform approach to evaluating these works, **and the evaluation may be qualitative or quantitative**. The nature of the organization that produces the work, the distribution of the product, reviews of it (as appropriate), peer or editorial reviews, citations of the work, its adoption by and its influence on its academic discipline, and other factors will contribute to its stature in an academic discipline.

### Concluding Comments

As the university's *Faculty Handbook* indicates, the nature of scholarship, as depicted in Table 1, takes many forms and the value of it depends on a variety of factors although the contribution of the form of scholarship to an academic discipline is central to determining its stature. Rarely does one scholarly product shape a faculty member's career. Rather, various forms of scholarship produced over an extended period of time contribute to one's stature in her or his academic discipline. Our aim is to meet or exceed the standards the university has set for us in our academic disciplines.